

Conclusions and recommendations

At the moment international aid to the Palestinian territories provides substantial funds to the Palestinian authorities. It also provides directly for many of the Palestinian people's needs. This gives the Palestinian Authority and Hamas considerable room in their budgets. When they use that money to promote hatred of the West and Israel, and the view that a violent victory is preferable to a peaceful compromise, that significantly reduces the chances of achieving a stable peace.

Donations to the Palestinian territories can have more positive effects. The Palestinian Authority's signing up to the Quartet Principles – which require that they take certain steps such as recognising Israel's right to exist - is due, in no small part, to donor pressure. The problem is not that we give aid to the Palestinian territories, which is vital for a people with few other sources of income, but that we focus our resulting influence solely on the question of whether the Palestinian Authority is preparing the necessary groundwork for peace with Israel.

We need to broaden our priorities and do all we can to ensure that the Palestinian Authority is preparing the Palestinian population for peace. More than 42 per cent of the Palestinian population are under 15 years old.¹⁴ Their attitudes will shape the future of any peace process. The very best of treaties will not be able to guarantee peace in the medium to long term if a generation of Palestinians are growing up indoctrinated to hate

Israel and the non-Muslim world. As John F. Kennedy said, "peace does not rest in the charters and covenants alone. It lies in the hearts and minds of all people."

There is a clear precedent for the kind of programme we could foster in the Palestinian territories in Northern Ireland where the British Government introduced, in 1989, a programme called Education for Mutual Understanding.¹⁵ The objectives of that scheme were that it should enable pupils:

"To learn to respect and value themselves and others; to appreciate the interdependence of people within society; to know about and understand what is shared as well as what is different about their cultural traditions; and to appreciate how conflict may be handled in non-violent ways."

If our donations can encourage principles like those to be put at the heart of the Palestinian Authority's engagement with its people, to replace the hate education we see today, then British taxpayers' money would be spent productively and peace in the Middle East and the security of Western countries would be promoted.

¹⁴ CIA 'The World Fact Book – West Bank', 20 November 2008

¹⁵ Smith, A. & Robinson, A. "Education for Mutual Understanding: The Initial Statutory Years", University of Ulster, Coleraine, 1996. <http://cain.ulst.ac.uk/csc/reports/mutual.htm>

About the Coalition

Key think tanks and taxpayer groups across Europe are working together to campaign for increased transparency and accountability in EU aid funding and how it is distributed. This report, translated into six languages, aims to secure reform of EU aid to the Palestinian territories, so that European taxpayers' money no longer supports hate education that harms the long-term prospects for peace in Israel-Palestine.

For media enquiries, or for information about the coalition, please contact

Susie Squire, Campaign Manager,
the TaxPayers' Alliance (UK)
+44 (0)7974 691 865
susie.squire@taxpayersalliance.com



United Kingdom
Susie Squire
The Taxpayers' Alliance
T: +44 (0)845 330 9554
susie.squire@taxpayersalliance.com



France
Jean Baptiste Léon
Taxpayers Association of Europe
T: 01.78.09.92.63
jeanbaptisteleon@contribuables.org



Germany
Michael Jaeger
Taxpayers Association of Europe
T: +49 89 126008 20
Michael.Jaeger@taxpayers-europe.org



Italy
Alberto Mingardi
Istituto Bruno Leoni
T: 011-0702087
alberto.mingardi@brunoleoni.it



Slovakia
Ivan Kuhn
Konzervatívny inštitút M. R. Štefánika
T: +421 2 546 300 61
ivankuhn@institute.sk

Palestinian Hate Education since Annapolis

At the Annapolis conference in November 2007 Palestinians and Israelis pledged to reach a "final peace settlement [that] will establish Palestine as a homeland for the Palestinian people just as Israel is the homeland for the Jewish people." Unfortunately, while the Palestinian Authority leadership have signed up to a two state solution, this report will present extensive evidence that they continue to encourage very different attitudes in their population. That hate education drives ongoing violence, leading to the kind of destruction seen in the recent conflict in the Gaza strip.

Britain donates significant amounts of money to the Palestinian territories:

- Direct funding from the British Government. In 2007/08 the Department for International Development (DFID) spent £63.6 million in the Palestinian territories.¹ Some of this is given as direct aid to the Palestinian Authority.
- Funding through the European Union. In 2007 the European Commission allocated €420 million of European Union aid to the Palestinian Territories.² This is roughly 0.37 per cent of the total EU budget. Assuming the UK pays its share of that amount through its contributions to the EU budget, that means the UK donated another €52 million in 2007. That was around £35 million at 2007 exchange rates.

In total Britain therefore gave nearly £100 million in aid to the Palestinian territories. At the same time there is extensive evidence that the authorities in the Palestinian territories are supporting television, radio and newspapers that promote hatred and violence, and school textbooks that radicalise young Palestinians.

Donations to the Palestinian territories create a responsibility to ensure that the Palestinian Authority does not misuse its budget. That responsibility exists whether British taxpayers are directly supporting the promotion of hatred and violence or providing the Palestinian Authority with funds that it can use to do the same or providing services that Palestinian authorities would otherwise be expected to provide, freeing up room in their budget to use as they like.

That responsibility to take account not just of how a donation is spent, but the broader activities of the recipient, is reflected in the Quartet Principles, which laid out a set of rules that the Palestinian Authority must comply with in order to receive direct aid. It has also been reflected in law, in a case in the United States where it was ruled that charities must be held liable if they give money to groups that engage in terrorist acts, even if they stipulated the funds were for humanitarian purposes.³

¹ DFID, 'Occupied Palestinian Territories', <http://www.dfid.gov.uk/countries/asia/palestine.asp>

² European Commission 'Occupied Palestinian Territory', http://ec.europa.eu/europeaid/where/neighborhood/country-cooperation/occupied_palestinian_territory/occupied-palestinian-territory_en.htm

³ Robinson, M. 'Court upholds \$156M Palestinian terror verdict', *Associated Press*, 4 December 2008

⁴ Salama, V. 'Hamas TV: Palestinian Media in Transition', *TBS Journal*, 2006

⁵ Feuilherade, P. 'Shake-up of Palestinian media', *BBC News*, May 2005

⁶ Reporters without borders, 'Palestinian Territories – Annual report 2008', http://www.rsf.org/article.php3?id_article=25440

⁷ BBC News 'Country profile: Israel and Palestinian territories', 28 October 2008, http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/middle_east/country_profiles/803257.stm#media

⁸ BBC News 'The Palestinian press', 13 December 2006, http://news.bbc.co.uk/1/hi/world/middle_east/6176691.stm

⁹ Reporters without borders, 'Palestinian TV stations suffer in power struggle between rival factions', 24 September 2008, http://www.rsf.org/article.php3?id_article=28704



broadcast

The Palestinian Media's close connections to the authorities

All of the sources in this report are from the official Palestinian state broadcaster and their official newspaper or other sources closely connected to the West Bank and Gaza authorities. All of the material shown has been printed or broadcast since Annapolis, after both sides committed themselves to seeking a two state solution.

The Palestinian Media



The Palestinian Broadcasting Corporation (PBC) includes the Voice of Palestine radio station, and PATV. Both are a product of the 1993 Oslo accords and were established in 1994 by then PA Chairman Yasser Arafat.⁴ In 1995 the PBC's Directors were made to report directly to the PA Chairman. In May 2005 the PBC was put under the control of the Ministry of Information.⁵ "After the Hamas victory at the polls in 2006, [...] government-owned media were put under the control of President Abbas."⁶ President Mahmoud Abbas is thereby directly responsible for their output.



Al-Hayat Al-Jadida, is the official newspaper of the Palestinian Authority.⁷ The BBC reports that "the PA owns a majority stake in the company and at least some of its staff are PA employees."⁸ The paper is distributed free to Palestinian security personnel.



Al-Aqsa is the Hamas television station and was established on 7 January 2006. Its format is based on the Al Manar TV station which is operated by Hezbollah. Al-Aqsa is the subject of a US Congressional initiative to declare it "a specially designated global terrorist network". This is a verdict shared by the PA.⁹

Statements encouraging hatred and violence in the Palestinian media

All these broadcasts and newspaper articles have been translated by the monitoring organisation Palestinian Media Watch. Every single example is from the period since the Annapolis conference in November 2007. The material presented in this section illustrates that, despite the Palestinian Authority's commitment to a two state solution, they are not encouraging attitudes in the Palestinian people that are conducive to a lasting peace.

Exhibit 1:

Najat Abu Bakr, Member of the Palestinian Legislative Council, 26 February 2008, PBC

"We take pride in this [Arab nationalist] language because we are the authentic Arabs who believe in our Arabism, our faith, our cause, our Nation, in our right to struggle and to resistance in all possible ways [euphemism for violence] in all the occupied lands, in Palestine, Lebanon the Golan and Iraq..."

Exhibit 2:

Abbas Zaki, PA Representative in Lebanon, 7 January 2008, PBC

"Shame on anyone who says that Fatah put down its weapons! Since June 14 [Hamas takeover] until today, Fatah's Al-Aqsa brigades [executed] 220 operations, which are 30% of the [total] operations."

Exhibit 3:

Najat Abu Bakr, Member of the Palestinian Legislative Council, 25 August 2008, PBC

"It doesn't mean that we don't want the 1948 borders [all of Israel], but in our current political program, we [PA] say we want a state on the 1967 borders [...] We [Palestinians] were created on this land in order to liberate it, to live on it, to continue as people of Ribat [Religious war]. We are on the land of Ribat and must remain [on it] until Resurrection."

This statement supports one made by the PA leader Mahmoud Abbas, who said to the Jordanian Daily Al Dustor, on 28 February 2008, "Now we are against armed conflict because we are unable. In the future stages, things may be different..."

Exhibit 4:

Sheikh Muhammad Hussein, Mufti of Palestine, 6 June 2008, PBC

"We are in Ribat [religious war] on this blessed land, and we are the owners of this holy land. It is a great honor bestowed by Allah to be part of the chain of the Ribat, which continues until Resurrection."

Exhibit 5:

Ahmed Dughmush, a Fatah leader promises a million martyrs to liberate cities deep within Israel and Ziad Abu Ein, PA Deputy Minister for Prisoners, says he won't accept a two state solution. These statements were aired on 8 January 2008 and 13 May 2008 respectively, PBC

"Palestine is our dream. Brothers, Oh Fatah's loyal masses the land is thirsty [for martyr blood] [...] Jaffa, Haifa and Acre are calling. Ramallah.. Nablus and Gaza: "When will we meet and break the chains?" To Jerusalem march millions of Martyrs" - Ahmed Dughmush

"We want to return to Lod, Ramle, Jaffa and Haifa. Let everyone hear, this is our land, this is our country, these are our villages, and we will return to them. The Palestinian won't accept any paradise except his own paradise, in his home in Bet Shea'n, Ashkelon, in Lod, Ramle. We will return Allah willing, to the land that is seeking its people" - Ziad Abu Ein

Ahmed Dughmush and Ziad Abu Ein, two senior PA officials, are promising to 'liberate' the cities of, among others, Jaffa, Haifa and Acre. These cities are integral parts of the Israeli state, as recognised by the UN. They are within the borders of pre-1967 Israel and could not form part of a Palestinian state without the abolition of Israel.

Exhibit 6:

Praising the female suicide bomber Ayyat al-Akhras, 23 December 2007, PBC

PA TV Host: "Father of [suicide terrorist] the Shahida [Martyr] Ayyat al-Akhras. You and your cause deserve the greatest respect. Ayyat was very young (age 17) when she was martyred. In our opinion, Ayyat is a hero, and we want to hear more and remember this martyr, since we hold her memory dear in our hearts."

Father: "[Ayyat's] goal was to study journalism, to promote her Palestinian cause around the world."

PA TV Host: "Through Ayyat's heroic act [suicide bombing] she succeeded in reaching the entire world."

The Palestinian media often refers to suicide bombers as Shahids. Shahid is a term for someone who has died for the sake of Allah and is taken as a mark of respect. Above we see that the suicide bomber, Ayyat al Akhras, was praised as a Shahida, a hero and a martyr on Palestinian Broadcasting Corporation television.

Exhibit 7:

Praising Samir Kuntar, 23-25 June 2008, PBC

Samir Kuntar crushed the head of four-year-old Eynat Haran with his rifle, he also killed her father. He was serving four life sentences for murder when he was released in a prisoner exchange with Hezbollah. However, the PA portrayed Mr Kuntar's release, in June 2008, as a great victory and Mr Kuntar as a man to respect and admire.



The official newspaper of the Palestinian Authority, Al-Hayat Al-Jadida, reported that "President Mahmoud Abbas congratulated yesterday's exchange of prisoners and bodies of Martyrs. The president sent blessings to Samir Kuntar's family." Furthermore, Ahmad Dahbur, former undersecretary of the PA Ministry of Culture, wrote "Blessings to the free heroes and their head, the heroic fighter Samir Kuntar, and blessings to the spirit of the heroic Dalal Mughrabi and to the friends of the heroes."¹⁰

On the PBC Samir Kuntar was referred to as a hero "who had committed heroic acts in which Jews and soldiers were killed". He was continually shown on the PBC next to a map of Israel entirely covered by the Palestinian flag (see above - once again symbolising the aim to abolish Israel, not merely re-establish the 1967 borders).

Exhibit 8:

Maps of Palestine which abolish the state of Israel, 23-25 June 2008



During the Annapolis conference the PBC aired an advert publicising the national census, showing Palestine with the map of Israel entirely covered by the colours of the PLO. This was aired several times a day during the Annapolis conference and promotes a very different agenda to that embodied by talk of a two state solution at the conference.

Exhibit 9:

The Palestinian Authority use the same images as Hamas to lay claim to Israeli cities, 25 May 2008, PBC and Al-Aqsa

Both the PBC and Al-Aqsa aired programmes featuring Palestinian children with the keys to Israeli cities, including Haifa, Ramla, Acre, Jaffa, Beer Sheva, Beit Shean and Jerusalem.



Exhibit 10:

Adnan Ayash, History Professor: 5 June 2008, PBC

"There are diseases like smallpox, that can be eradicated, but the disease that was inflicted on the Palestinian people and the Arab nation in general, that's the Jewish disease, the Zionist disease, which is a cancerous disease, that started with occupying and taking over lands in 1904 [...] Those (Jews), from 1904 to 1947, reached 605,000. That's the cancer that spreads over the lands."

School text books

There are ongoing concerns that school textbooks contribute to the radicalisation of young Palestinians. These books are still in use in the Palestinian education system. The claim, from the EU Heads of Department, in 2002, that only textbooks published before 2000 contain incendiary material is clearly incorrect.¹¹

Exhibit 11

"History of the Arabs and the World in the 20th Century"¹²



العراق، والأولاد حروباً لنزع أسلحتهم، وقد رفضت جامعة الدول العربية هذا الإصدار، وتجاهلت الولايات المتحدة وبريطانيا المواقف الرسمية والشعبية، وبدأت بتوجيه ضرباتها العسكرية بتاريخ ٢٠٠٣/٣/٢٠ وضحت المواقف والمشات العراقية التي انتهت قواها نحو المدن العراقية بمشاركة قوات عسكرية من جنسيات مختلفة، سلبت بغداد، ولم يستسلم العراقيون لهذا الاحتلال، بل استطاعوا تنظيم أنفسهم والبدء في مقاومة يائسة لتحرير العراق، وتكثفت القوات الأمريكية من القصف على الرئيس العراقي صدام حسين تمهيداً لمحاكمته، وشكلت حكومة جديدة في ظل تصاعد حدة المقاومة العراقية ضد استمرار الاحتلال.

Translation:

"The U.S. and Britain... stormed Iraqi cities with the participation of military forces from different countries and Baghdad fell. The Iraqis did not surrender to this occupation but succeeded in organising themselves and a brave resistance to liberate Iraq began." (page 147)

Exhibit 12:

Reading and Texts¹³



Translation:

"O heroes, Allah has promised you victory.... Do not talk yourselves into flight... Your enemies seek life while you seek death. They seek spoils to fill their empty stomachs while you seek a Garden [Paradise] as wide as are the heavens and the earth... death is not bitter in the mouth of the believers. These drops of blood that gush from your bodies will be transformed tomorrow into blazing red meteors that will fall down upon the heads of your enemies." (page 16)

¹⁰ Dahbur, A. 'Daily Column', Al-Hayat Al-Jadida, 17 July 2008

¹¹ EU Heads of Mission, "Palestinian Schoolbooks", May 2002,

http://ec.europa.eu/external_relations/mepp/faq/heads_%20omission_schoolbooks.pdf

¹² "History of the Arabs and the World in the 20th Century", p.147, via Palestinian Media Watch

¹³ PA schoolbook, Reading and Texts Part II, Grade 8, p.16, Palestinian Media Watch report